|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Element** | **Outstanding**  **3** | **Good**  **2** | **Average**  **1** | **Insufficient**  **0** | **Score** |
| **Equity and Excellence** | Dissertation thoroughly articulates equity and excellence for one or more underserved populations (e.g., those from poverty; Black, Latinx, or First Peoples; English as a second language speakers; underidentified and underrepresented in gifted, creative, and talented education) | Dissertation articulates equity and excellence for one or more underserved populations (e.g., those from poverty; Black, Latinx, or First Peoples; English as a second language speakers; underidentified and underrepresented in gifted, creative, and talented education) | Dissertation articulates equity OR excellence for one or more underserved populations (e.g., those from poverty; Black, Latinx, or First Peoples; English as a second language speakers; underidentified and underrepresented in gifted, creative, and talented education). A clear connection for how they address both equity AND excellence is missing. | Dissertation does not articulate equity and excellence for one or more underserved populations (e.g., those from poverty; Black, Latinx, or First Peoples; English as a second language speakers; underidentified and underrepresented in gifted, creative, and talented education) |  |
| **Engagement with Population** | Articulates an authentic and transformative strengths-based narrative about the underserved population(s) considered. | Articulates a strengths-based narrative about the underserved population(s) considered. | Articulates a related narrative about the underserved population(s) considered. | Underserved populations are considered from a deficit. AND/OR No direct connections are made between the work and the needs or goals of the underserved populations. |  |
| **Potential Impact** | Contributes new and important insights/understandings and/or work within the field. | Contributes new ideas/understandings within the discipline but does not address a major area of importance. | Confirms existing ideas/understandings within the discipline but does not address a major area of importance. | Creates impact outside the scope of the award. |  |
| **Overall Quality** | Quality of the dissertation, including methodological design and implementation, is exceptional | Quality of the dissertation, including methodological design and implementation, is well done | Quality of the dissertation, including methodological design and implementation, is average | Quality of the dissertation, including methodological design and implementation, is below average |  |
| **Total:** | | | | |  |